

SHERLOCK HOLMES: WEAPONIZING LOGIC FOR BRITISH NATIONAL IDENTITY

Author

Katherine Rose
katherine.rose@mail.utoronto.ca



Affiliations

University of Toronto, Trinity College, Arts and Sciences

Introduction

Background: In the Victorian era, Sherlock Holmes served as a symbol of logic, order, and scientific progress.
Research Question: How did 20th-century British media transform this private detective into a state-sponsored tool for propaganda?
Thesis: The reinvention of Holmes as a patriotic hero exposed the tension between rational intelligence and ideological manipulation, revealing how wartime culture uses literary icons to redefine nationhood and truth.

Objective

The objective of this research is to analyze the strategic “weaponization” of Sherlock Holmes as a cultural icon and explore how his cultural transformation from a private detective into a patriotic hero demonstrates the ways in which societies repurpose familiar literary figures to sustain national unity and manage public anxieties during times of global crisis, also known as “cognitive hacking.”

Results

The evolution of Sherlock Holmes as a national icon progressed through several distinct stages, beginning in the Victorian era where he served as a private investigator embodying the nation's faith in reason, logic, and imperial order. By the early 20th century, his role shifted into that of a protector of the British Empire, specifically demonstrated in "*The Adventure of the Bruce-Partington Plans*" where he worked to secure top-secret naval plans and catch spies to defend British scientific innovation and national security. This evolution intensified during World War II, as he was reinvented as an explicitly patriotic intelligence agent for the government's “Inner Council,” dedicated to combatting Nazi sabotage and neutralizing the psychological warfare of enemy radio broadcasts such as “Lord Haw-Haw.” Ultimately, Holmes’s legacy is as a cultural archetype and a permanent conduit for Britain’s self-image, reflecting a collective faith in rational perseverance and moral endurance.

Methodology

- **Comparative Analysis:** This study examines the evolution of Holmes across different media, focusing on two primary case studies:
 - **Literature:** “*The Adventure of the Bruce-Partington Plans*” (proto-propaganda).
 - **Film:** *Sherlock Holmes and the Voice of Terror* (1942) (explicit propaganda).

Theoretical Framework: Using media history and psychological theory, specifically the concept of "cognitive hacking," i.e. how media exploits trust and cultural values to influence public perception.

Key Findings

- 01 **The Intelligence Shift:** Holmes transitioned from a private detective or citizen to an agent of the British “Inner Council,” using his deduction skills to create a national defence mechanism.
- 02 **Fighting Disinformation:** The 1942 film directly countered Nazi broadcasts (inspired by the real-life "Lord Haw-Haw") created to spread panic amongst the British. Holmes served as a conduit for creating clarity among chaos.
- 03 **Cinematic Realism:** Filmmakers used newsreel-style realism and high-contrast lighting to blur the lines between fiction and wartime news, leveraging Holmes's credibility to manage public anxiety.
- 04 **Rationalism as Ideology:** Holmes's logic, originally intended to counteract the magical or supernatural idealism of the detective fiction of Conan Doyle’s time, was adapted to legitimize moral propaganda, persuading audiences of British superiority.

Conclusion & Discussion

While some critics argue that wartime adaptations oversimplified Holmes, this research suggests these shifts actually maintained his intellect by applying it to modern existential threats. This study highlights how societies reshape familiar figures to provide moral certainty and psychological comfort during times of extreme instability and chaos. Potential future research includes exploring how 21st-century adaptations of Holmes continue to reflect modern anxieties about surveillance and global terrorism.

Acknowledgements

This research was supported by the Book & Media Studies Department at St. Michael’s College

Bibliography

- Burrow, Merrick. “Holmes and the History of Detective Fiction.” Cambridge University Press, (April 29, 2019): 15. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781316659274.003>.
- Churchill, David. “Criminal Investigation.” Oxford University Press, (January 11, 2018): 168. <https://q.utoronto.ca/courses/412158/files/folder/Readings/5%20-%20Jack%20the%20Ripper%20and%20Other%20Victorian%20Villains%20-%20A%20Study%20in%20Crime%2C%20Criminology%2C%20and%20Detective%20Work?preview=38967488>.
- Clausen, Christopher. “Sherlock Holmes, Order, and the Late-Victorian Mind.” The Georgia Review 38, no. 1 (Spring 1984): 104-5. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41398643>.
- Forest, James J.F. “Influence Warfare and Modern Terrorism.” Georgetown University Press 10, no. 1 (Winter/Spring 2009): 81. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43134193>.
- Long, M. H. “Policies of Great Britain.” Council on Foreign Relations 6 no.2 (Jan. 1928): 245. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20028603>.
- Maloney, Martin. “Origins of the Detective Film.” University of Illinois Press on behalf of the University Film & Video Association 27 no. 2 (1975): 34. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20687277>.
- McConnell, Frank D. “Sherlock Holmes: Detecting Order Amid Disorder.” Wilson Quarterly 11, no. 2 (Spring 1987): 172-3. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/40257858>.
- Morriello, Francesco A. “Elementary My Dear Watson - Holmes on Stage and Silent Film,” SMC192 Sherlock Holmes: Mass Media and Fan Culture from the Victorians to the Present Day. PowerPoint Presentation, University of Toronto, St. Michael's College, Oct. 20, 2025, <https://q.utoronto.ca/courses/412158/files/folder/Lectures?preview=39984784>. Oct. 9, 2025.
- Rawlins, John, dir. Sherlock Holmes and the Voice of Terror. 1942; Universal City, CA: Universal Pictures.
- Rendell, Ruth. “The Penguin Complete Sherlock Holmes.” Foreword to “His Last Bow,” by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle. Penguin Books (2009): 914.
- Rock Cahill, Matthew. “Silencing Lord Haw-Haw: An Analysis of British Public Reaction to the Broadcasts, Conviction and Execution of Nazi Propagandist William Joyce.” Western Oregon University (June 16, 2015): 2. <https://wou.omeka.net/s/repository/item/7196#:~:text=Item&text=This%20paper%20focuses%20primarily%20on,by%20war%20and%20its%20aftermath>.
- Sample, C. et. al, “A Cultural Exploration of Social Media Manipulators.” Journal of Information Warfare 17, no. 4 (Fall 2018): 66. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26783827>.
- Siegel, Jack M. “The First Citizen of Baker Street.” Chicago Review 2, no. 2 (Spring 1947): 49. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/25292774>.
- Smith, Christopher. “Sherlock Holmes and the Nazis: Fifth Columnists and the People’s War in Anglo-American Cinema, 1942-3.” Journal of British Cinema and Television 15.3 (2018): 313. <https://www.eupublishing.com/doi/full/10.3366/jbctv.2018.0425>.
- Zieger, Susan. “Holmes’s Pipe, Tobacco Papers and the Nineteenth-Century Origins of Media Addiction.” Journal of Victorian Culture 19, no. 1 (January 2, 2014): 24–42. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13555502.2014.889428>.